

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC<br/>REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS<br/>LIABILITY LITIGATION</b> | <b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327<br/>MDL No. 2327</b> |
| <b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO<br/>THE CASES ON THE EXHIBIT<br/>ATTACHED HERETO</b>        | <b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN<br/>U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>      |

**JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS WITHOUT PREJUDICE**

Plaintiffs, whose cases are listed on the attached Exhibit A, and Defendants, Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., and/or Ethicon LLC (collectively, the “Ethicon Defendants”), jointly move to dismiss without prejudice all claims against the Ethicon Defendants, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2). No other defendants remain. Therefore, the Ethicon Defendants respectfully request the Court close this case and strike it from the docket. Each party shall bear her or its own costs.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jon C. Conlin

Jon C. Conlin  
Cory Watson  
2131 Magnolia Avenue  
Suite 200  
Birmingham, AL 35205  
(205) 328-2200  
TVMInfo@corywatson.com  
*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

/s/ William M. Gage

William M. Gage (MS Bar #8691)  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4561  
william.gage@butlersnow.com

/s/ Susan M. Robinson

Susan M. Robinson (W. Va. Bar #5169)  
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 24338

(304) 414-1800  
srobinson@tcspllc.com  
*Counsel for the Ethicon Defendants*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on this date I electronically filed this document with the clerk of the court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of this filing to CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ William M. Gage

**EXHIBIT A**

| <b>Civil Action No.</b> | <b>Case Style</b>   |
|-------------------------|---|
| 2:13-cv-03930           | Wendy Riddle v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:13-cv-12657           | Catherine I. Montgomery v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:13-cv-13189           | Francis J. Davis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:13-cv-13194           | Roberta Ann West v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:13-cv-15006           | Joan Carol Quintana and Javier Quintana v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:13-cv-15088           | Robin Akers and Jackie L. Akers, Sr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:13-cv-15478           | Debra Marchelle Kotzen and Daniel Morris Kotzen v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson           |
| 2:13-cv-17149           | Frances Louise Rodriguez and Marcos Rodriguez, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:13-cv-17359           | Cathy Elmore and Terry L. Elmore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                          |
| 2:13-cv-18122           | Lori-Jo Saucier and Mark Emile Saucier v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:14-cv-17947           | Jeral Dean Reed and Hubert S. Reed v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:14-cv-22524           | Mae B. Pridgen and Ernest L. Pridgen v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:13-cv-18433           | Sara R. Arnold and Robert L. Arnold v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                       |
| 2:16-cv-08733           | Pamela Zehnder v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:13-cv-11074           | Kimberly Gay Sanders and Anthony Glen Sanders v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC             |
| 2:13-cv-11591           | Tammi Lou McClure v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC   |
| 2:13-cv-11986           | Doris Ann Miller Johnson and Bill Gatlin Johnson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC          |
| 2:13-cv-13210           | Karre Jean Brown v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC  |
| 2:13-cv-14008           | Tonya M. Jackson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC  |
| 2:13-cv-14411           | Carole Ann DeFoor and Jerry DeFoor v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                        |
| 2:13-cv-14869           | Karla Vanessa Fisher and Richard Dennis Fisher v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC            |
| 2:13-cv-15847           | Marjorie Delores Longsworth and Stephen Arthur Longsworth v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC |
| 2:13-cv-15859           | Darlene Marie Reeves and Michael Lee Reeves v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC               |
| 2:13-cv-16052           | Kelliann B. Bligh v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC   |
| 2:13-cv-16886           | Rebecca D. Moore and Richard Moore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                        |
| 2:13-cv-17395           | Emily K. Mitch v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC  |
| 2:13-cv-17964           | Gloria E. Sam v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC   |

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| 2:13-cv-18078 | Jennifer Lynn Mann and Michael James Mann v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC          |
| 2:13-cv-18254 | Rose M. Boyd v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                                       |
| 2:13-cv-22405 | Mary Loretta Rosenberger and Daniel P. Rosenberger v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC |
| 2:13-cv-33861 | Carmen G. Rodriguez and Richard L. Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC       |
| 2:14-cv-12876 | Geri Lynn Roberts v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                                  |
| 2:14-cv-15542 | Sabrina D. Wright v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                                  |
| 2:14-cv-17268 | Juanita S. Weisel and Roland L. Weisel v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:14-cv-17893 | Barbara Smith Matthews and Richard Bruce Matthews v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:14-cv-19719 | Kimberly Rayetta Merritt and Jerry Wayne Merritt, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:14-cv-21400 | Elizabeth B. Dowd v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:15-cv-11054 | Sandra Revels v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:15-cv-11085 | Bertha C. Selinger v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-07528 | Sonya Roberson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-08732 | Emma Madaras v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:17-cv-02701 | Virginia Aycox v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-07964 | Eva Jordan v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:14-cv-17314 | Tabitha Goff and Andrew Goff v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:13-cv-06877 | Tammy Remagen and Aubrey Dale Remagen v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC              |
| 2:13-cv-12672 | Kristin Frances Kuyper and Arjen Philip Kuyper v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC     |
| 2:13-cv-14751 | Nettie Lynn Miller v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                                 |
| 2:13-cv-14757 | Jill Bonar v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC   |
| 2:13-cv-14842 | Andrea Ann Tirey and Jack Lee Tirey v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                |
| 2:13-cv-14862 | Lana Charlene Price and Anthony Price v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC              |
| 2:13-cv-14965 | Margarita Ortiz and Robert Ortiz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                   |
| 2:13-cv-14990 | Elida Munoz and Luis Munoz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                       |
| 2:13-cv-15272 | Lauren Lee Borger and Philip Lee Borger v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC            |
| 2:13-cv-15546 | Renee T. Kovach and Dale Paul Kovach, Sr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC          |
| 2:13-cv-15658 | Consuela Esnaola v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                                   |
| 2:13-cv-17361 | Angela Renae LeMay and Ted Barry LeMay v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC             |
| 2:13-cv-17377 | Deborah A. Hood and Bernard Hood, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC              |

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| 2:13-cv-17382 | Audrey Joanne Rhodes and Robert Allen Rhodes v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC |
| 2:13-cv-17996 | June Rene Beitler and Daniel Mark Beitler v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:13-cv-18183 | Cordelia W. Lemons and William T. Lemons v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC     |
| 2:13-cv-18194 | Linette Spinks and Hosea Spinks, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC         |
| 2:13-cv-18198 | Mary A. Fountain and Marc Fountain v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC           |
| 2:14-cv-17956 | Deidre Louise Crawford v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:14-cv-19722 | Nicole M. Killen and Eric Killen v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:14-cv-21665 | Deborah A. Scholvin and Gary L. Scholvin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:14-cv-24590 | Heather Gindra Morrison and Douglas C. Morrison, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:14-cv-25441 | Brenda K. Hayden v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-04896 | Deborah L. Jarrett and Bobby Dale Jarrett v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:15-cv-05952 | Angela K. Stafford v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-06047 | Bonnie R. Gilchrist and David Gilchrist v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:15-cv-07976 | Lynne M. Hendrix v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-11081 | Sophia Glenn v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:15-cv-14931 | Sandra Wilson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-01455 | Martha S. Flores and Juan Garza v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:16-cv-01480 | Martha Joan McCollough and James Owen McCollough, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson      |
| 2:16-cv-03189 | Sharon E. Saylor and Michael W. Saylor v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:16-cv-04444 | Lori J. Nodine and Dennis R. Nodine v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:13-cv-17096 | Elizabeth Diane Mace and Timothy Duane Mace v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC  |
| 2:14-cv-31432 | Martha Goggans v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:13-cv-15063 | Connie Gratz and Robert Gratz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                |
| 2:14-cv-24054 | Dawn M. Rose v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-00456 | Connie Sue Creech v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:12-cv-00763 | Laquita Riddick and Carl Riddick v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC             |
| 2:16-cv-06708 | Hollie Alexander v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:14-cv-00530 | Mary L. Armijo v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:17-cv-00834 | Kathryn K. Brown v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:17-cv-04374 | Rita L. Chitwood v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:17-cv-03892 | Elizabeth R. Emanuelli v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:17-cv-04091 | Minnie P. Martin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:12-cv-09865 | Susann Lynn Sloane v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:17-cv-03769 | Merrilyn Terry and Charles Terry, Jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:14-cv-19870 | Shirley I. Timbrello v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                       |
| 2:15-cv-14056 | Ethel M. Turner and Dennis L. Turner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                       |
| 2:17-cv-02699 | Glenda D. Tyler v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| 2:13-cv-12831 | Monique Anderson and Robert Anderson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson         |
| 2:14-cv-19864 | Georgette M. Hahn and David T. Hahn v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson          |
| 2:17-cv-04092 | Catherine Susan McClary v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:13-cv-13064 | Ralene McMillan v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                |
| 2:17-cv-04093 | Kristin M. Parker v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:13-cv-15718 | Kimberly Payton v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC                |
| 2:17-cv-04094 | Judy B. Russell v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:17-cv-04095 | Barbara B. Sanders v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                           |
| 2:17-cv-04096 | Tammy Standridge v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:17-cv-04097 | Andrea Mabins Stewart v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:12-cv-08772 | Juanita C. Tate and Geoffrey W. Tate, jr. v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson    |
| 2:16-cv-02055 | Patsy Taylor v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                 |
| 2:14-cv-17951 | Linda Marie Thomas and Frederick Leon Thomas v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:17-cv-04098 | Shirley M. Williams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |